WRAPPERS 2 FOCUS GROUP REPORT

SUMMARY

To support the project's initial consultation activities[1] three focus groups[2] took place during May 2012, to gain insight into different people's responses to:

- resource discovery issues
- existing and prototype resource discovery services

Overall, the responses from participants supported the project approach; raised some further issues and challenges for the project to consider; and gave very valuable feedback for the final project developments.

THE FOCUS GROUPS:

- University of Cambridge, 9th May 2012
- University of Swansea, 14th May 2012
- University College London, 23rd May 2012

FOCUS GROUP FORMAT:

Each session lasted 60-90 minutes. An informal approach was taken to encourage free flowing discussion.

FOCUS GROUP TOPICS:

- Introduction to Wrappers & Open Book Projects, JISC Resource Discovery Programme and principles of Culture Grid
- Review of resource discovery issues
    - Guided discovery - the 'wrappers' approach
    - Collections information and research outputs (Open Book)
    - Applying course subject terms to collections (Joint Academic Coding System)
    - Open licensing of resource discovery data
- Review of resource discovery services
    - Fitzwilliam Collections Search (from the first Wrappers project)
    - University Museums in Scotland Search
    - UK University Museum portal (first version, focused on at UCL)
    - Culture Grid Search (focused on at University of Swansea)

SUMMARY FINDINGS AND PROJECT RESPONSES RE RESOURCE DISCOVERY ISSUES

GUIDED DISCOVERY

The Wrappers approach of finding museum objects through collection descriptions was well received by all participants. It was seen as being of particular value for:

- people who are not very familiar with particular museums and their collections
- learning and teaching
- cases where items in collections were either not available or not extensively catalogued online

---

[1] http://contextualwrappers2.wordpress.com/2012/02/13/consultation-findings/

[2] The project originally aimed for five focus groups, but three proved more practical and fit for purpose

June 14, 2012

WRAPPERS 2 FOCUS GROUP REPORT

Challenges of the approach that were noted included the question of whether collection level descriptions could sufficiently represent large collections of very disparate material.

The project will seek to mitigate the above issue by providing search of items alongside guided access and ways for people to create, describe and share their own collections of diverse items for particular purposes.

COLLECTIONS INFORMATION AND RESEARCH OUTPUTS

The sister-project 'Open Book'[3] approach of associating research outputs with collections was also well received by participants e.g. to indicate the value of collections to the Research Excellence Framework and for internal advocacy.

Although this is not expected to be an output of the Wrappers 2 project it indicates an area for future development.

APPLYING COURSE-SUBJECT-TERMS (FROM THE JOINT ACADEMIC CODING SYSTEM)

Participants saw this as being of value as it would provide:

- consistency of subject-terminology at collections level
- a familiar way into collections for higher education teachers, learners and administrators who should be aware of the terms and structure of JACS

Reservations were raised by some participants re the terms and structure of JACS and its high number of first-level entry-points.

The project plans to address the latter by either 'hard-coding' a set of 'faculty' level terms in browse interfaces, or adding a higher-level into the version of JACS held within the Culture Grid Terminology Bank.   The project will also inform JACS of these findings.

OPEN LICENSING OF RESOURCE DISCOVERY DATA

This was seen as a good thing in principle by all participants to encourage discovery, use and impact of collections, although it was noted that this view may not be shared by others, including senior management and that further support with making the case for open licensing may be needed.

The project will provide links to relevant material from the JISC Discovery and the European Union Europeana programmes (http://discovery.ac.uk/businesscase/ and http://pro.europeana.eu/web/guest/support-for-open-data).

SUMMARY FINDINGS AND PROJECT RESPONSES RE EXISTING AND PROTOTYPE RESOURCE DISCOVERY SERVICES

The existing resource discovery services (Culture Grid and University Museums in Scotland searches) were commended for speed of search and access to diverse collections, with many suggestions for improvements for the new Culture Grid and UK University Museum searches. The main features desired by participants include: advanced search/refinement functions; improved display options; ways to collate, share, comment and tag items and searches; and ways to contact collections about resources. Many of these mirrored the findings of earlier consultations and the project will aim to include as many of the features as possible into the final technical developments.

---

[3] http://jiscopenbook.wordpress.com/

June 14, 2012

WRAPPERS 2 FOCUS GROUP REPORT

APPENDIX 1 FOCUS GROUP PARTICIPANTS

Participants represented a range of roles, including collections managers, researchers, educators and learners; covering subjects from the arts, humanities and sciences. The project acknowledges the valuable contribution and support of all those who took part:

THE FITZWILLIAM MUSEUM, UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE, 9TH MAY 2012

- Rachel Hand (curatorial assistant. Anthropology)
- Lorana – graduate student with Rachel Hand
- Dan Pemberton – (collections manager, Earth Sciences)
- Paola Ricciardi – (research associate, MSSPB, Fitzwilliam)
- Claire Wallace –(collections assistant., history of science – Whipple)
- Rebecca Bridgeman – (research assistant for Islamic Pottery, Applied Arts, Fitzwilliam)

THE EGYPT CENTRE, UNIVERSITY OF SWANSEA, 14TH MAY 2012

- Wendy Goodridge (assistant curator Egypt Centre)
- Emma Eacott (3rd year Egyptology student Swansea University)
- Laura Ricard (3rd year Egyptology student Swansea University)
- Garethe el-Tawab (curator Swansea Museum)
- Philip Bethel, Project Officer Community, Heritage and Swansea City FC 1912-2012
- Ken Griffin (PhD student in Egyptology about to complete)
- Ros Thomas (Egypt Centre- MA in Egyptology)

UNIVERSITY COLLEGE LONDON, 23RD MAY 2012

- Margaret Serpico, UCL Petrie Museum
- Ivor Pridden, 3D Encounters, Petrie Museum of Egyptian Archaeology, UCL
- Mark Carnall, Grant Museum
- Sam Washington – Digital Resources Manager, UCL Museums & Collections
- Andrea Fredericksen – Curator, UCL Art Museums
- Isabella Kirton – Faculty, Department of Information Studies
- Gemma Romain – Research Associate, Geography

June 14, 2012

WRAPPERS 2 FOCUS GROUP REPORT

APPENDIX 2 DETAILED RESPONSES TO RESOURCE DISCOVERY ISSUES

UNIVERSITY OF CAMBRIDGE, FITZWILLIAM MUSEUM, 9TH MAY 2012

GUIDED DISCOVERY – THE 'WRAPPERS' APPROACH

- The Fitzwilliam Museum feels that it would be most useful to create Collection Level Descriptions (CLDs) at a curatorial stage; these would then be kept within the museum as well as in the Culture Grid.
- Other collection's systems don't have the ability to create these records/relationships (so creating CLDs on Grid is also useful)
- The project is an 'excellent idea' and CLDs will be worthwhile.
- Currently there is nothing that gives a clear and succinct introduction to a subject (for example: Islamic Art) when searching for them online, and CLDs would do this.
- Attendees stated that it is important that museums still host the information online within their own websites as well as Culture Grid.
- CLDs can enable a user to gain more information about where to go next.
- It would also be difficult to keep some pieces of information separate when they need to be within CLDs.

COLLECTIONS INFORMATION AND RESEARCH OUTPUTS (OPEN BOOK)

- It would be useful to include with collections associated bibliographic information / information regarding research that is currently being carried out within that collection.
-

APPLYING COURSE SUBJECT TERMS TO COLLECTIONS

- Fixed terminologies would be useful to create subject headings which could then be filtered down through search results.
- Terminologies such as JACS would be useful at an extremely high level but not so at object level.
- Subject terminologies are not the only fixed terminology which would be useful to have. Collectors / donors would be a useful terminology to use as a way to discover information and resources.
- It would be useful to have collector based collections as well as subject. This would be a good way to join up University Museum collections and would provide different entry points for the same object.
- Many University Museum collections were split up between different museums when returned to the UK, having donor/collector searches would enable these collections to be joined up, but Is the need for searching via collectors more specific to University Museums?
- How would objects that can be seen as multidisciplinary be included/allowed for within fixed subject terminologies?

OPEN LICENSING OF RESOURCE DISCOVERY DATA

- Museums should not limit the amount of information that they provide online. University Museums often find that traditional owners of their collections are overseas and thus online information is a way to give them access to their collection.
- Open data useful as it is another way that museums can publish results of their research.
- Some museums are hesitant to release information about their collections online, especially re security

WRAPPERS 2 FOCUS GROUP REPORT

UNIVERSITY OF SWANSEA, THE EGYPT CENTRE, 14TH MAY 2012

GUIDED DISCOVERY – THE 'WRAPPERS' APPROACH

- CLDs can also be useful when wanting to search across collections either within one institution or many.
- CLDs can and should be created within museums, and also within the Culture Grid.
- Swansea museum is already creating collection level descriptions 'in-house'.
- CLDs would be useful for making connections to similar objects within other collections.
- Benefit to searching across multiple museum collections, especially for academic research.
- CLDS could include the contact details of the person within an institution who is responsible for the specific collection.

COLLECTIONS INFORMATION AND RESEARCH OUTPUTS (OPEN BOOK)

- Incorporating bibliographic/research material into records and CLDs would be very useful, in particular if this could link to an online resource where available.

APPLYING COURSE SUBJECT TERMS (JACS) TO COLLECTIONS

- Subject headings can be useful when wanting to browse through collections using CLDs.
- Fixed terminologies may be difficult to use within university museums as they tend to be very interdisciplinary.
- JACS could be relevant but only to the people who are doing the specific courses that fit within the terms.
- Egyptology terminologies can be very complex as there are several ways to spell the same phrase and records could fit within numerous subject headings.
- Could be useful to limit terms that can be imported in CLDs to a specific terminology structure.
- It can be difficult to identify which subject/section specific object records may be located within and therefore a keyword search is still useful.

UNIVERSITY COLLEGE LONDON, 23RD MAY 2012

GUIDED DISCOVERY – THE 'WRAPPERS' APPROACH

- CLDs are especially useful for people who are 'new' to the collections.
- Service should offer both a guided and specific/direct search facility.
- Direct search approach is more useful for experts/researchers/HE educators, for example ' History of' type subjects e.g. History of science.
- Researcher thought that guided searches would still be useful, as often items are not effectively catalogued for retrieval.
- CLDs do currently exist for Natural History collections e.g. as part of Fenscore project http://fenscore.man.ac.uk/.
- Art Museum is looking at applying subject terms to item records but Wrappers approach may be useful for them too.
- Humboldt Museum Germany have good example of dual presentation of search and guided access. (http://www.naturkundemuseum-berlin.de/en/sammlungen/)
- CLDs would be useful for creating course subject guides and content.

COLLECTIONS INFORMATION AND RESEARCH OUTPUTS (OPEN BOOK)

- UCL currently include references to research in their Collection Management System.
- Might be challenging to assign research outputs to CLDs if it only applies to few items.
- Relating research outputs to collections could help with internal advocacy.

June 14, 2012

WRAPPERS 2 FOCUS GROUP REPORT

APPLYING COURSE SUBJECT TERMS TO COLLECTIONS

- 19 subject terms on landing page is too many, fewer terms at start point would be better.
- Would need to be careful about what you apply JACS to...subject of content or something else? For example: a teaching collection about zoology put under 'education' as well as zoology or not?
- HE Teachers should find it very useful way to access collections.
- Issue with relating terms to items as they would ideally need to be catalogued with the same terms.

OPEN LICENSING OF RESOURCE DISCOVERY DATA

- In principle favour open licenses, but issues may arise within the upper levels of organisations.
- Useful to have guidance available on making the case for open licensing to higher management
- 3rd party issues may exist with some 3D object records from Petrie.
- Art Museum raised the need to clarify licensing of resource discovery data distinct from artworks/images.

June 14, 2012

WRAPPERS 2 FOCUS GROUP REPORT

APPENDIX 3 DETAILED RESPONSES TO RESOURCE DISCOVERY SERVICES

The focus groups made the following comments / feature requests re existing and new resource discovery services

Feature	Comment	From
Advanced search	Advance search (for experienced users)	Swansea
Advanced search	Advanced search useful e.g. to allow items from particular places or materials to be found	UCL
Browser compatibility	Site does not work on text based browsers	UCL
Contact / Visit Collection	Contact details of collection/curator useful with CLDS	Swansea
Contact / Visit Collection	Useful to have contact details for the collection displayed	UCL
Copy	Make it clear on homepage that it is search of different / disparate sources and leads to different websites	UCL
Create collections	'create own collection' function was useful, and would prove particularly helpful when creating subject guides for courses	UCL
Detail display & link-out	Better to have view details before link or for details to appear on roll-over on hit list	UCL
Detail display & link-out	Best to offer view details then 'go to resource' to give consistent presentation of data	UCL
Linking Colls & items	Need to find a way to relate JACS terms to items within as well as whole collection	UCL
Linking Colls & items	When in a CLD there needs to be links to items within that collection	UCL
Multi-refine	Enable choice of more than one refinement	UCL
Nav of Results	Next at top of results screen as well as bottom	Swansea
Nav of Results	Next' button should always take user to the top of next page	UCL
Print	print and download record and results as pdf	Swansea
Refine	Add a function to refine search by image and record type	UCL
Refine list display	(Default) Display of refinement panels with results	Swansea
Refine list display	Show refine search panel as default	UCL
Refine list order	Refinement lists to be alphabetical	Swansea
Refine list order	Refine list need to be alphabetised	UCL
Result Display	When no results are found, the page needs to state that 'No results were found'	UCL
Result Display	Search screens should display the total number of records found within the search	UCL
Result display options	Number of results options to be 50 100 500	Swansea
Result Nav	Add a 'Prev' button as well as 'Next'	UCL
Result Nav	Search page should display previous search path, for example: Home > Fine Art > Flowers > Van Gogh	UCL
Results display	Present broad results first then let user refine	Cambridge
Results display	Preference for broad results first then user refinement	Swansea
Results-type display	Better to include CLDs within results set not weighted at end (if chose to search both).	UCL
Results-type	CLDs did need to be included within searches, but that they should be easily	UCL

June 14, 2012

display	identifiable either in separate columns or highlighted in different colours.	
Search options	Select to include CLDs or not on the first search box	UCL
Share	Share records and results by email and social media	Swansea
Sort results	Sort results option useful e.g. alphabetical or by collection or accession number	UCL
Unrefine	Un-refine option useful rather than relying on back button	UCL
User Comments	Add comments to found records	Cambridge
User Tagging	Add tags to found records	Cambridge
User Tagging	Useful if could add terms/tags to records	UCL
Browse Place & Period	Browse by place & period as well as course-subject	Swansea
Citation	Bibliographic references esp with urls useful within CLDs	Swansea
Design	Record display pages should have more colour/landing page images run through them too	UCL
Record display	Could be useful to make the identifier on a record clickable	UCL
Refine by search	search within a set of results	Swansea
Refine display	identify if subject refinements are about place, period, subject or offer those as distinct refine options	UCL
Result display	Swap round the links: Title of record takes you to the CG record, 'View Details' should be renamed as 'Go to resource' and take user directly to resource	UCL
Result display option	Researcher preferred list-view as shows more detail and only need to scroll down, not scan across	UCL
Result display option	Arts Museum prefer grid to list as default	UCL
Results display	Hit list could include ID/accession number	UCL
Search prompt	"Did you mean" prompt for search-terms	Swansea
Search/refine option	Search by 'donor'	Cambridge
Search/refine option	Donors as controlled list	Cambridge
Subject-browse	19 terms at first browse level may be too much	Swansea
Subject-browse	19 terms at first browse level may be too much	UCL
Access method	Both search and browse options need to be available for users	Swansea

June 14, 2012